

Six Basic Ideas About Legal Proof:
Lectures and Aphorisms

Table of Contents

Introduction and Aphorisms	i
Lecture I: General Theory of Legal Proof	1
Power	1
Reason.....	2
Burden of Proof	4
Benefit of the Doubt.....	6
Proof.....	9
Legal Proof.....	11
Facts in Issue.....	13
Lecture II: Two Different Kind of Legal Proof	15
The Standards of Proof	15
The Third Standard of Proof.....	18
A Spectrum of Standards?	20
Two Kinds of Legal Proof	22
Proof and Truth.....	23
Shifting and Splitting the Burden of Proof	25
The Unified Evidentiary and Persuasive Burdens	26
Shifting the Burden of Proof: Pleading.....	29
Affirmative Defences.....	31
Pleading in the Alternative.....	32
Splitting the Burden of Proof.....	35
Wigmore’s Treatment of the Split Burden.....	38
Quasi-Criminal Civil Cases	39
Conclusion	41

Lecture III: Proof of a Document: Probate	45
Introduction.....	45
Formalism	50
Documents	53
Proof of a Will	55
The Technical Nature of Succession Law	55
A Very Brief History	57
The Formalities of Execution.....	58
Testacy and Intestacy	61
Bentham on the Formalities of Execution	61
Reversing the Burden.....	64
Testamentary Capacity.....	66
Knowledge and Approval	70
Conclusion	70
 Lecture IV: Proof and Presumption in Tort Law	 73
The Plaintiff-Friendliness of Different Torts.....	75
Plaintiff-Friendliness in Negligence	76
The Spectrum of Presumptions.....	80
Torts Actionable <i>Per Se</i>	82
Intention and Knowledge.....	84
Intention, Voluntariness and Action	88
The Imprecise Nature of Presumptions.....	90
The Ordinary-Course-of-Business Presumption.....	91
<i>Res Ipsa Loquitur</i>	93
Causation.....	95
Breach of Fiduciary Duty.....	97
Remoteness	98
Damages.....	99

Lecture V: The Persistent Myth of Conclusive Proof.....	103
The Dramatic Power of Conclusive Proof	104
The Mythical Status of Cross-examination.....	106
Oaths in Medieval English Law.....	108
A Very Short History of Common Law.....	110
The Jury	114
The Oath-Challenge in Ancient Greek Law	118
Physically Conclusive Proof: Ordeals in Medieval England.....	124
The <i>Basanos</i> -Challenge in Ancient Greek Law.....	125
Legal Fictions	127
<i>Apophugon</i> – A Legal Fiction in Classical Athens.....	128
Legal Fictions and Legal Myths	129
Torture and Ordeal.....	131
The Myth of Conclusive Proof in Modern Law.....	134
Legal Rules and the Myth of Conclusive “Proof”	136
Estoppel.....	138
<i>Autrefois Acquit and Autrefois Convict</i>	140
Conclusion	141
Lecture VI: Speculation on the Future of Legal Proof	143
The Rationalist Model	144
Basic Changes in Law.....	147
What Future Cases Will Reveal.....	154
Closing Words	158

APPENDICES	159
------------------	-----

Lecture II

Appendix 1: The Standard of “Proof” on a Question of Law	159
Appendix 2: The Blue Bus Problem	161
Appendix 3: What is Quasi-Criminal?.....	164
The Railroad Fire Cases.....	165
A Political Explanation.....	168
Appendix 4: Wigmore’s Analysis of <i>Menomenie</i>	171

Lecture III

Appendix 5: An Informal Approach to Probate.....	173
Appendix 6: A Hard Case of Intestacy	174

Lecture IV

Appendix 7: “On the 30 th , or at the latest, the 31 st ”	175
Appendix 8: Predicting the Future	177
The Value of Money	179
Appendix 9: Negligence and Contributory Negligence.....	184
Appendix 10: No-Fault	186
Appendix 11: Simpson’s Comment on <i>Rylands</i>	188

Introduction

Appendix 12: Twining’s Assumptions	189
--	-----

BIBLIOGRAPHY